

1 **Navigating the Ethics of COVID-19 in Otolaryngology**

2

3 Andrew G. Shuman, MD FACS<sup>1,2</sup>

4

5

6 <sup>1</sup> Center for Bioethics and Social Sciences in Medicine, University of Michigan Medical School

7

8 <sup>2</sup> Department of Otolaryngology - Head & Neck Surgery, University of Michigan Medical  
9 School

10

11

12 Contact Information:

13 Andrew G. Shuman, MD FACS

14 1904 Taubman Center

15 1500 E Medical Center Drive

16 Ann Arbor MI 48109-5312

17 Office: 734 232 0120 Cell: 734 834 6930

18 [shumana@med.umich.edu](mailto:shumana@med.umich.edu)

19

20 The author declares no conflict of interest or funding sources. The contents of this original

21 manuscript have not been presented or submitted elsewhere.

22 Conceived, drafted, edited and approved final manuscript, and takes full responsibility for its

23 content

24 **Abstract**

25 The COVID-19 pandemic has dramatically altered how otolaryngologists contemplate and  
26 assume their roles in health care delivery. The ethical implications of this pandemic upon our  
27 practice are formidable, and distinct from other surgical fields. The salient ethical issues of  
28 public health stewardship and safety, distributive justice and non-abandonment are distilled for  
29 the practicing otolaryngologist.

30

ACCEPTED

31           The COVID-19 pandemic has undermined every aspect of medical care virtually  
32 overnight.<sup>1</sup> Early publications underscore the overwhelming acuity and volume of patients who  
33 will require treatment, and how this will strain systems with insufficient resources to absorb  
34 these incremental needs.<sup>2,3</sup> Issues related to resource utilization, exposure risk, and unique  
35 implications of the procedures we perform have essentially overridden many basic elements of  
36 what otolaryngologists have taken for granted in daily practice. The safety precautions and other  
37 downstream effects on our specialty have been well described, and undoubtedly will be further  
38 explored in the emerging literature as our collective experience matures.<sup>4</sup> Herein, the ethical  
39 morass that COVID-19 creates will be examined for those grappling with its daily reality.

40           In general, tenets of medical ethics for practicing otolaryngologists have focused on the  
41 primacy of choices and actions involving individual patients and the singular doctor-patient  
42 relationship. These patient-centered principles significantly differ from concepts of public health  
43 ethics, which are by necessity population-, rather than individual- driven.<sup>5</sup> The overwhelming  
44 epidemiological need to “flatten the curve” and limit the spread of COVID-19 across  
45 communities requires steps that would otherwise not be taken due to risk of harm to or  
46 disenfranchisement of individuals. For example, in the current pandemic, any otolaryngologic  
47 evaluation or treatment that risks aerosolizing virions must be limited, modified, or ideally  
48 delayed.<sup>6</sup> Likewise, while individual rationing decisions rarely play a role in day-to-day care  
49 provided by otolaryngologists, concern for available medical supplies, personal protective  
50 equipment (PPE), and hospital beds requires us to allocate in a way that is uncommon in the  
51 developed world. As a result, many otolaryngologists are facing the prospect of anxiously  
52 waiting until they can resume any semblance of their daily routine.

53           The concept of delaying or refusing medically necessary care is anathema to dedicated  
54 clinicians. We pride ourselves on assuming supererogatory responsibilities in times of crisis.<sup>7</sup>  
55 But the COVID-19 era has created a situation in which expedited and evidence-based care, even  
56 for urgent conditions such as airway stenosis and head and neck cancer, may be all but  
57 impossible. While part of this relates to resource allocation, it also involves protection of our  
58 patients. Clinical exposure that may increase iatrogenic contraction of the virus is even more  
59 concerning when realizing that high risk patients are even more vulnerable to poorer outcomes.<sup>8</sup>  
60 Likewise, head and neck cancer treatment will not only potentially expose patients, but treatment  
61 effects may also make them frailer and more vulnerable, even though delaying cancer treatment  
62 carries its own risks. These dilemmas create impossible choices and tradeoffs.

63           Our inability to optimally perform our work is not an excuse to remain idle. Patients in  
64 need and those scheduled for upcoming procedures and appointments can and should be  
65 contacted remotely in order to provide guidance and surveillance. We can convey a great deal of  
66 reassurance and support without face-to-face interactions. In addition, we have an obligation to  
67 provide care and avoid perceived or real senses of abandonment on the part of our patients, and  
68 thus triage urgent/emergent situations to limited available resources is still needed. In addition,  
69 depending upon workforce constraints, otolaryngologists may be asked to assume other roles in  
70 healthcare delivery during the pandemic, from contributing ambulatory surgical  
71 ventilators/supplies, to working in other clinical units, to donating blood. Alacrity to help in  
72 unconventional means has historically been a strength of our profession, and the time is nigh to  
73 meet it head-on.

74           Another aspect of compassionate care provision involves addressing the psychosocial  
75 well-being of our patients, both for those who have COVID-19 and those who do not. Clinicians

76 will need to validate these concerns, and shepherd local and national resources that may be  
77 helpful, even if we feel unequipped to provide sufficient support ourselves.<sup>9</sup> The emotional  
78 burden and toll upon us as clinicians is similarly taxing; these extraordinary situations invariably  
79 engender intense moral distress. Clinician wellness and self-care and paying heed to signs of  
80 burnout and compassion fatigue are critical components of remaining sufficiently resilient to  
81 continue our necessary work in extraordinary circumstances.<sup>10</sup>

82 COVID-19 will test the very fabric of healthcare delivery, and require otolaryngologists  
83 to exercise moral and professional fortitude in ways previously unimaginable. This involves a  
84 deliberate and careful balance of limiting exposures and maximizing benefit, while still  
85 upholding our intrinsic ethos to serve our patients in need.

86 **References**

87

- 
- <sup>1</sup> Parodi SM, Liu VX. From Containment to Mitigation of COVID-19 in the US. *JAMA* 2020.
- <sup>2</sup> Zhou F, Yu T, Du R, et al. Clinical course and risk factors for mortality of adult inpatients with COVID-19 in Wuhan, China: a retrospective cohort study. *The Lancet* 2020.
- <sup>3</sup> Kucharski AJ, Russell TW, Diamond C, et al. Early dynamics of transmission and control of COVID-19: a mathematical modelling study. *The Lancet Infectious Diseases* 2020.
- <sup>4</sup> Givi B, Schiff BA, Chinn SB et al. Safety recommendations for evaluation and surgery of the head and neck during the COVID19 pandemic. *JAMA Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg* 2020 (In press).
- <sup>5</sup> Lee LM, Spector-Bagdady K, Sakhuja M. Essential Cases in the Development of Public Health Ethics. In: H. Barrett D, W. Ortmann L, Dawson A, Saenz C, Reis A, Bolan G, editors. *Public Health Ethics: Cases Spanning the Globe* [Internet]. Cham (CH): Springer; 2016. Chapter 2. 2016 Apr 13.
- <sup>6</sup> Interim Infection Prevention and Control Recommendations for Patients with Suspected or Confirmed Coronavirus Disease 2019 in Healthcare Settings. 2020. at <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/infection-control/control-recommendations.html>.)
- <sup>7</sup> Vercler CJ. Surgical ethics: surgical virtue and more. *Narrat Inq Bioeth*. 2015;5(1):45-51.
- <sup>8</sup> Liang W, Guan W, Chen R, et al. Cancer patients in SARS-CoV-2 infection: a nationwide analysis in China. *The Lancet Oncology* 2020;21:335-7.
- <sup>9</sup> Manage Anxiety & Stress 2020. at [https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/prepare/managing-stress-anxiety.html?CDC\\_AA\\_refVal=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.cdc.gov%2Fcoronavirus%2F2019-ncov%2Fabout%2Fcoping.html](https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/prepare/managing-stress-anxiety.html?CDC_AA_refVal=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.cdc.gov%2Fcoronavirus%2F2019-ncov%2Fabout%2Fcoping.html).)
- <sup>10</sup> Emergency Responders: Tips for taking care of yourself. 2020. (Accessed 3/17/2020, 2020, at <https://emergency.cdc.gov/coping/responders.asp>.)